Research by the National Association of Student Financial Aid Administrators (NASFAA) and Public Agenda indicates that optimally functional and innovative FWS programs incorporate all of the following components:



in executing a successful FWS program. The components identified in this system are a result of findings from a research project comprised of a literature review and policy scan, a national survey, and focus groups. In general, where survey and focus group results differed, our recommendations relied more strongly on the survey findings, since the survey respondents were a more representative sample than the much smaller focus groups. The "Promising Innovative Practices" sections on the following pages list current practices for each of the seven areas that survey

In general, four-year private institutions appear to have greater resources and stronger internal channels of communication between departments than other sectors, which favorably impacted promising innovative practices. This material is based on research funded in part by the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation. The findings and conclusions contained within are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect positions or policies of the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation.





1 IDENTIFY WHERE FWS FUNCTIONS ARE LOCATED WITHIN THE INSTITUTION

FWS functions can be within the purview of the financial aid office (FAO), but can also be dispersed across the institution. Survey findings showed:

- Management of FWS Expenditures/Fund Usage: 85% reported this function was in the FAO, 4% in the bursar's office, and 2% in payroll.
- Data Collection: 65% reported this function was in the FAO, 4% in student employment, 4% in human resources, 3% in institutional research, and 3% in payroll.
- Coordination of FWS Community Service and/or Job Location and Development Programs: 55% reported this function was in the FAO. For community service, 4% reported it is in student employment, 2% in human resources, and some institutions have specific community service offices that fulfill this role. For job location and development programs, 4% reported it is located within student employment and 2% in human resources.
- Advertising FWS Positions: 56% reported this was carried out by the FAO, 11% by student employment, and 5% by human resources.
- Hiring/Placement: 55% reported this function was in the FAO, 11% in student employment, and 6% in human resources.
- Managing FWS Payroll: 34% reported this function was in the FAO, 41% in payroll, 10% in human resources, 8% in student employment, and 7% in the bursar's office.

Promising Innovative Practices:

- · Using technology to connect office systems and databases that are currently maintaining separate records.
- · Partnering with the institutional research office to leverage data compilation and analysis skills.

2 ADDRESS THE DISCONNECT FROM AWARD TO EMPLOYMENT

A key piece of a robust FWS program should include some type of intervention to better connect the receipt of an award to actual employment. Many more students are awarded FWS in their aid package than actually end up employed in FWS positions. Twenty-eight percent of four-year private survey respondents reported that fewer than half of the students awarded FWS at their institution were employed in an FWS position, lower than the overall survey response rate of 33%. At the four-year private institutions, it was more likely that placement rates were in the 60%-80% range. Focus group participants expressed that as students got further into their college careers, the gap widened because upperclassmen were more likely to seek out non-FWS jobs with higher pay that offered more real-world work experience. This was somewhat exasperated by the expressed lack of workplace skills that first-year students were seen to have, which made them less desirable than upperclassmen to some employers. Survey respondents said many FWS-awarded students simply did not apply for FWS positions, some found non-FWS employment, others applied but were not hired, and some students could not find FWS positions they wanted.

Promising Innovative Practices:

- · Offering incoming first-year students the opportunity to start FWS positions in the summer before matriculation.
- Offering returning students a higher wage to make FWS positions more attractive.
- Expanding the types of FWS positions offered to provide a wider range of job experiences.

3 ADVERTISE FWS POSITIONS

Because the gap between students with FWS awards and those taking FWS positions is so large, any step to increase the percentage of eligible students in positions is beneficial to the program. Advertising is one way to expose FWS students to the possibilities of FWS employment, whether that be by promoting the variety of job types available, the flexibility in scheduling, or other beneficial aspects of FWS jobs. Only 34% of four-year private institution survey respondents thought that their school's advertising of FWS positions was "very effective." Fewer than half of those involved in FWS administration reported that their school had an online portal to advertise FWS positions.

Promising Innovative Practices:

- Establishing online portals for students that provide information on the available FWS jobs.
- Holding job fairs for FWS students.





4. MATCH STUDENTS WITH FWS JOBS

Another key component to a successful FWS program is the ability of an institution, to the extent possible, to help connect students with jobs related to their career interests. Only some (40%) of our four-year private institution survey respondents reported that they would always take the student's educational program or career goals into account when placing students in FWS positions, assuming the student could articulate such goals. Unfortunately, only 18% of four-year private college survey respondents thought that their school was "very effective" at helping students find positions that reflect their goals. Because placement of FWS students into positions is not isolated in the FAO, it is important to have institution-wide practices and policies to ensure the FWS student and employer experiences are uniform and positive. Focus group attendees told us that the general perception of FWS positions is that they are more clerical in nature. This misperception could discourage faculty and staff with other types of positions from thinking of them as potential FWS positions and turn students away from looking for an FWS position.

Promising Innovative Practices:

- Educating staff, faculty, and students on the actual types of positions that can be FWS jobs.
- Promoting more of a mentor/mentee relationship between FWS students and employers through trainings.
- Exploring being able to offer students employed in FWS positions academic credit, when applicable, in addition to their FWS wages.

5 MONITORING STUDENT AWARD USAGE

One of the key difficulties FWS administrators reported is monitoring student award usage at the individual level. A negative consequence of not monitoring fund usage can be the sudden termination of a student's employment if a student runs out of funding, which can, in turn, contribute to poor academic performance, dropping a course, or even dropping out of school. In the four-year private sector, when this happens it can end the student's employment, but in many cases the institution attempts to continue the employment with institutional or departmental funds. Some schools have systems in place to monitor fund usage, but few have systems that will alert the program administrator when a student is on track to prematurely use up the allotment.

Promising Innovative Practices:

- Using technology to create systems that alert all parties if projections indicate the student will run out of FWS funding.
- Encouraging the student and employer to work out a schedule in advance so the relationship between hours worked and the FWS award is fully understood, as well as an agreement as to whether the student will still be employed after their FWS award runs out and, if so, what the funding source will be.

6 ADDRESS BARRIERS TO FULFILLING COMMUNITY SERVICE REQUIREMENTS

Per federal regulations, at least 7% of a school's FWS allocation must be used to employ students in community service jobs and at least one student must be employed as a reading tutor or in a family literacy project, but one quarter of institutions reported difficulty meeting these requirements. FWS administrators reported they would like the definition of what constitutes a community service position to be broadened so they can more easily expand their community service offerings. In addition, about half of community service FWS positions are off-campus, which can create a barrier to filling the positions because for students, getting to the job can be costly, time-consuming, confusing to figure out, or all three. Only 12% of four-year private college respondents told us that their school has a job location and development program, and this could be expanded. Only 12% of those that did have such a program were operating it in collaboration with other schools.

Promising Innovative Practices:

- Offering mentor programs that pair FWS college students with younger students in the community to assist with the college
 decision-making and application process, especially in communities with low levels of educational achievement, in order to
 satisfy community service requirements.
- · Providing transportation facilitated by the school or community service agency for off-campus community service positions.





7 DETERMINE THE EFFECTIVENESS OF FWS

Throughout the other areas there has been a lack of data that allow the institution to understand how to improve the process of implementing FWS. Few institutions indicated they collect data that link retention or the graduation rate of FWS students to the FWS program. Fewer still have conducted research on the long-term impact of FWS participation on readiness for employment or workplace engagement. Only 19% of four-year private respondents thought that their school was "very effective" in helping students meet their postsecondary educational costs. And only 18% thought that their school's FWS program helped students find FWS positions that complemented their educational programs or career goals. We think collecting this and other data would be helpful and contribute to a successful program.

Promising Innovative Practices:

- Intentional link up with IT to help step up data collection process.
- Distributing surveys to students, both before and after their FWS experience, that measure change over time on aspects related to retention and future success in careers, then re-distributing surveys several years after graduation.



